

## **WEST UNIVERSITY HISTORIC ZONE ADVISORY BOARD**

Minutes of Meeting

January 26, 2010

The West University Historic Zone Advisory Board met at the Trinity Presbyterian Church at 400 East University Avenue in the Fellowship Hall on Tuesday, January 26, 2010. The meeting was called to order by board Chairman Jim Bly, at 6:15 P.M.

- 1. Sign In - Members Present:** Jim Bly - Chair, Barbara Macri, Noah Sensibar, Chris Gans, Jim Phillips and Jeff Thomas.

**Members Absent:** Lori Boston, Matt Williams

**Guests:** Leo R. Katz  
Michael McGrath

- 2. First order of business; Approval of meeting notes:** Brief discussion of unfinished minutes from the meeting of December 29, 2009. No minutes presented, no motions made.
- 3. HPZ 10-02. Applicant Architect Leo Katz. Owners Michael McGrath and Eileen Romer. Addition to 937 N. 5<sup>th</sup> Ave.** Mr. Leo Katz presented plans for an addition of a master bedroom at the back of the house. Mr. Katz stated the southwest corner of the house addition would project about six feet from the existing walls and be visible from 5<sup>th</sup> Ave. The proposed addition will match the existing house in scale and detailing. The new hip roof will match existing slopes and the roof shingles will match existing shingles. The new windows will be wood with concrete sills and match the existing windows around the house. All the proposed openings will have a deep reveal. The proposed addition will have a stucco finish and the finish color will coordinate with the existing house brick walls. Mr. Katz stated the proposed addition meets all C.O.T. zoning setbacks and height requirements. He said the proposed addition is in keeping with the residential development zone. Mr. Katz showed photographs of the front of the house, and the development zone plan view of Catalina Park and the homes fronting 5<sup>th</sup> Ave. neighboring the McGrath/Romer house. Mr. Katz said this was his understanding of what the development zone is. Mr. Katz's presentation included photos that illustrated how difficult it would be to see the proposed addition from the street. Mr. Katz presented a site plan of the applicant's house and showed the new addition extending six feet to the south from the existing house with a nine-foot setback off the patio wall to the south. The proposed addition will occupy approximately half of the square footage of an existing covered patio. The owners want to preserve the remaining patio and redwood deck. Mr. Katz explained the interior layout of the residence after the addition. Mr. Katz then showed elevation views. He said the roof would follow the same ridgelines and hip roof design as

existing with the use of a similar dormer vent. Mr. Phillips asked for clarification of the roof line at the existing roof as it meets the proposed addition. It was explained that to preserve the existing covered patio and to minimize costs, the covered patio and the addition roofs, coming together on different slopes, do not join. This leaves an open, triangle shape view while looking north into the covered patio area. Mr. Phillips called this an abrupt slicing of the roofs and stated it looked odd; Mr. Katz said closing or finishing the open triangle area was up to the owners to resolve. Mr. Katz said a new roof over the whole house was discussed, but said it would be difficult to accomplish. The Board members had a lengthy discussion concerning the roof. No photos were available of the back, covered patio. Mr. Sensibar asked about a window shown on the west elevation view that looked like a picture window. Mr. Katz agreed. Mr. Katz didn't think this would be in our preview because this window cannot be seen by anyone. Mr. Katz stated a large window overlooking the garden was a desire of the owner. Mr. Sensibar stated that WUHZAB is charged with a 360-degree review and "Design Guidelines for West University Historic District", page # 23 states "Picture windows ... are not appropriate" and he showed us on the same page a drawing of a picture window that is labeled, "NO". Mr. McGrath and Mr. Katz will look at other window types that are approved by Design Guidelines. We again discussed the problematic roofs with no solution forthcoming. The Board agreed we have many buildings in our neighborhood that appear pieced together due to additions. Mr. Katz said he and the owners tried to preserve as much of the existing wood patio as they could. Mr. Katz wished they had an unlimited budget to resolve the roof structure. Mr. Gans suggested moving the large post to the edge of the addition (as seen on the West Elevation) to balance the view between the two posts. Mr. Katz agreed.

**Motion:** Board member Chris Gans made a motion to recommend approval of the plans as submitted with a change in the west facing window to double hung or casement style windows (Per "Design Guidelines for West University Historic District", page # 23) and to balance the opening shown on the west elevation view with another wood post to match the existing post. Ms. Macri seconded the motion. The motion carried 5-1.

4. **Discussion of revised guidelines:** We will meet Tuesday, Feb. 2<sup>nd</sup>, 2010 at Trinity Church, same meeting room at 6:00 PM. We discussed methods used to revise guidelines. We agreed how to meet open meeting law requirements but we will not allow applicants with drawings for review. We will review from page 15 to the end or as far as we can go. Board member Noah told us that Jonathan Mabry, the historic officer for the C.O.T. might like to be invited to our discussion of revised guidelines.
5. **Discussion of board membership and election of new officers:** Jim Bly stated that he and Noah Sensibar have been Chairman and Vice-Chairman respectively for the past three years. No formal vote was taken; through a unanimous agreement, they will keep their positions. All agreed Jim Bly is a great Chairman; several examples were cited. The position of secretary remains open and will continue to be filled on a meeting-by-meeting basis. Mr. Bly mentioned there is one open position on the board. A resident

was discussed as a potential board member who would be a good addition and she is interested. Jim Bly will contact her.

- 6. Announcements / discussion:** We discussed the hierarchy for zoning regulations at the City of Tucson. The HPZ is the zoning authority, which gives WUHZAB its authority. WUHZAB will in the future try to cite our standards in our motions regarding applications. The Board exchanged phone numbers.
- 7. Call to the Audience:** Only Board members remain; no audience.
- 8. Adjournment:** Mr. Sensibar moved for adjournment and Mr. Phillips seconded.

The meeting adjourned at 7:20 P.M.

SUBMITTED THIS 28<sup>th</sup> day of January, 2010

Jefferson (Jeff) W. Thomas  
Secretary Pro Tem